



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Linda Williams (Chair), Dawn Hill-Holdgate (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, David Barham, Diane Coombs
Associate Commissioners: Jascin Leonardo-Finger, Abigail Camp **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, November 14, 2013 – NEW BUSINESS

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room –1:00 p.m.

Called to order at 1:04 p.m.

Staff in attendance: J. Grieder, HDC Assistant Administrator
Attending Members: Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp
Absent Members: Hill-Holdgate, Leonardo-Finger,
Late Arrivals: Coombs 1:06 p.m., Camp 1:05 p.m.
Early Departures: McLaughlin 2:58 p.m.

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

1. TON-Memorial Airport	14 Airport Road	Rev. COAs 55074/55625	78-1	NAG
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Bill McGuire , Nantucket Architecture Group Ltd – Explained project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60614	

III. OLD BUSINESS/QUORUM

1. Beardsley, Scott	138 Main Street – HSAB	Hardscape	41-521	Edgewater
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(00:06:06) Staff – Read previous concerns from Sept. 10. HSAB – What is age? No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60615	

V. NEW BUISNESS

1. Cape Cod Five	112 Pleasant Street	Enclosure for site items	55-149	B L F & R Arch.
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Arthur Reade , Reade, Gullicksen, Hanley, Gifford & Cohen LLP, for Cape Cod Five – Asked for a list of the issues with the building.			
	Chris Raber , Cape Cod Five – Trees have been planted. Belgium Block for the driveway is not yet installed.			
Public	Steve Butler , Building Commissioner – Confirmed that the building permit cannot be signed off today.			
Concerns	(06:08:13) Williams – Spoke to concerns raised at the November 12 meeting about architectural discrepancies with the building. Instructed the applicant to make separate as-built application for those. This addresses the hardscaping issues. There are a number of items that have not yet been installed; the applicant is seeking a temporary CO to get into the building with installation of missing element to follow by a certain time.			
	Barham – Concerned that the sidewalk and paving shown on the plan are not as presently installed on site. Reads the rectangular marks on the plan to be paving stones, not tarmac.			
	Discussion about the planters, handicapped ramp and the need for the sidewalk to be continuous.			
	Barham – There are 16 or 17 bollards shown on the plan, counted 23 to the left of the building alone. Don't understand the requirement for a "bumper guard" that is 5 feet into the air; don't think those are appropriate or approvable and that should be revisited. Stated he has overheard complaints about the level of night lighting under the drive through; it is very bright and inappropriate for the island. Would like the black panels at the beginning of the bays explained; they look like lane lights, which were not approved. There is a retaining wall work at the left front corner of the building that is not indicated on the plan. Would like confirmation that the air-conditioning unit (A/C) enclosure on the back of the building is as drawn; it looks larger and there is not sufficient space for screening planting. Need correct documentation of the routing of handicapped traffic. The gold eagles need to be removed from the lighting fixtures. The landscape plan has markings that are unidentified; need a plan that identifies what those mean or the irrelevant items removed from the plan and relevant items identified and properly located. Would like the dumpster bollards pulled inside the fence. Pointed out that meter boxes should be shown on the drawings for commercial structures. Would like to know the minimum height a bollard needs to be; these look too tall.			
	Camp – Agree with Mr. Barham. The lighting is a very bright white/blue not found elsewhere on the island.			
	Coombs – Asked for confirmation that that bike racks will be all wood. Asked about the generator and dumpster pads. Had asked for the National Grid template for the placement of the bollards; wants to confirm whether or not that many bollards are required. (Raber – Could not get that by this meeting.)			
	McLaughlin – Agree with what's been said. This site plan shows where the generator is going to go; at the last meeting, it was stated that it is moving; need new drawings showing the new location, the fence, and the gate.			
	Williams – The drive-through lighting needs to be reduced. Agrees about the excessive number of bollards; need to deal with which ones will be eliminated, the shape (the tops should be flat), what color they will be, and the sidewalk/crosswalk issue.			
	Discussion about correcting the bollards, consensus is those that are truly necessary should be dull grey and reduced in height.			
	Rendering of the fence and gate and size of enclosure, bollards, retaining wall to be applied for, A/C enclosure needs to be verified and changed, location of light poles clearly identified.			
	McLaughlin – Expressed his displeasure with all the changes made by the applicant in contradiction with the approved HDC drawings. Asked the architect for an answer. Raber explained that something was missed between the architect, contractor and the bank.			
Building	Canopy lighting is too bright; it needs to meet the code level for lumens.			
Concerns	Cornice detail is not in compliance with the approval.			
	Some windows are trimmed with a molded crown and some are mimic a cased window; that is not appropriate. Window heights have been changed in a manner that is inappropriate to the style of the building.			
	The overhangs, capitals and corner boards are bigger than they should be. The eave details are inappropriate and two colors. Porch post dimensions are wrong.			
	French doors should be 12-light with kick panel.			
	Corner boards on the cupola were not approved and are inappropriate; and the apron under the sill is missing.			
	Clapboard was approved cobblestone grey and the roof was approved 3-tab Weatherwood.			
	Signs are not to be lit and location of projecting sign is wrong.			
	Applicant is asked to survey the structure with the approval and return with actions they will take to bring it into conformity. The commission needs to see how all issues will be resolved before issuing an approval to allow the building commissioner to issue a CO.			
Motion	Motion to Hold the site plan for further information and revisions. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously Certificate #			

2. Beller, Gary	3 Willard Street	Retracting awnings on rear	42.4.1-18	B. Young
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Brent Young – (commissioners talking made his name hard to hear.) Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(01:04:55) Staff – Read application specifications. Barham – The hardware for the awning is the main concerns; it is not a period look for a bungalow. McLaughlin – Window awnings in this area are common; no concerns. Camp – Do not think the canopy is appropriate. Coombs – Would like it to be a different color. Discussion about the color being solid blue, and not being retractable.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

3. Donald Dimock	42 Bartlett Road	Move on (from 10 Salros)	66-530	D. Dimock
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Donald Dimock			
Public	None			
Concerns	(01:10:22) Discussion about orientation of structure on the lot. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60616	

4. Benson, Marlene	13 R Burnell Street – SAB	Change front door	73.4.2-89	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(01:12:18) Staff – Read application specifications. SAB – Not appropriate; not in keeping with area doors. Consensus is this is not appropriate.			
Motion	Motion to Deny due to being an architecturally inappropriate door style for ‘Sconset. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60617	

5. McClusky, Katherine	3Traders Lane – HSAB	Renovate	42.3.3-116	Bockus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Barham			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(01:14:41) Staff – Read application specifications. Structure is mid 18 th century; no age on the ell being demolished. HSAB – The Ell is unique and architecturally important; the balcony is not appropriate in the old historic district (OHD), and too much grading is proposed. Williams – Suggested a view to look at the 2-story deck that is being replaced and to ascertain the visibility.			
Motion	Motion to View. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

Minutes for November 14, 2013, adopted Nov. 26

6.	Morris, Joan et al.	18 Tautemo Way	Dormer & minor alterations	82-1	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Val Oliver – Presented project; age of structure 1968.				
	Joan Morris – Explained that there was a 30-year deed restriction against a dormer. Presented context photos.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(01:18:41) Staff – Read application specifications.				
	Coombs – No concerns.				
	McLaughlin – No comments.				
	Camp – Would prefer a dormer on either side of the chimney and brought off the roof line.				
	Barham – The windows are all 8-over-8 and 3-feet wide; the awnings should match the width of the rest of the windows. That would allow for jam facing on the corner side of the windows. There is an apron board or sill drawn across the full length of the dormer; should be under the windows only; dormer should come 12-inches off the roof.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per Exhibit A. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60618	
7.	21 Lincoln Avenue N.T.	21 Lincoln Avenue	Demo/re-build beach stairs	30-43	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Ray Pohl , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project. Some of the stairs are flush with the grade and don't need balusters.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(01:28:50) Staff – Read application specifications.				
	No one likes the balusters. Discussion about where those won't be necessary.				
	Barham – If all the landings are set at grade, there will be no need for the pickets. Likes the jogs.				
	Williams – Prefer the original railings. Concerned that the stairs have to be higher off the sand per Conservation Commission requirements.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
8.	21 Lincoln Avenue N.T.	21 Lincoln Avenue	Rev. COA 59157: house	30-43	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Ray Pohl , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(01:36:30) Staff – Read application specifications.				
	Coombs & Camp – No concerns.				
	Barham – The deck inappropriately straddles both the wall and the void. Also, it jumps out as not being appropriate for the period look of this structure.				
	Williams – Wouldn't mind it so much if it were couched better into the roof.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
9.	21 Lincoln Avenue N.T.	21 Lincoln Avenue	Rev. COA 59751: guest house	30-43	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.				
Representing	Ray Pohl , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns	(01:42:39) Staff – Read application specifications.				
	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Barham)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	60619	

10. Mastellone, Michael	74 N Liberty Street – HSAB	Add to second floor	41-236	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Val Oliver – The rear elevation is correct; the ridge will drop. Made the walls 6 feet to avoid adding dormers.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(01:44:47) Staff – Read application specifications. HSAB – No concerns. Barham – If the knee walls are 6 feet, the windows are 8 feet, which is peculiar looking; 4’6” knee walls would work. Camp, Coombs & McLaughlin – Agree. Williams – The ridge is too high compared to the original structure and the eave is the same.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the height of the addition lowered 18 inches. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60620	
11. Kaplan	37 Hulbert Avenue	Addition	29-20	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	Staff – The applicant has requested a hold.			
Motion	Motion to View without comment. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
12. Frazier	73 Hooper Farm Road Lot A	Windows/trim/color	67-330	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Alex Bagmet , Emeritus Development – Trim to natural and windows to 2-over-2 simulated divided light (SDL).			
Public	None			
Concerns	(01:48:42) Staff – Read application specifications. Barham – Building is more handsome with 6-over-6 windows. Okay with SDL and natural to weather. Consensus agrees.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the windows to remain 6-over-6, trim to be natural to weather and windows to be SDL. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60621	
13. Kahan	19 Bishops Rise	Major revisions	40-31.3	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	Staff – The applicant has requested a hold.			
Motion	Motion to View without comment. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

Minutes for November 14, 2013, adopted Nov. 26

14. Keefe, Carol	16 Osprey Way	Alterations to garage	83-21	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Val Oliver – Presented project; dormer does not face the street.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(01:53:25) Staff – Read application specifications. Williams – The plans lack cardinal points. Clarification of orientation of the garage. Barham – Dormer should be on the side away from the street. Camp – No concerns. Williams – Osprey and Tautemo have strange configuration of buildings. There are some context issues.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions.			
Vote	Carried	Certificate #		
15. McOllum House Trust	35 Eel Point Road	Fenestration revisions	32-63	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Ray Pohl , Botticelli & Pohl – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(01:57:47) Staff – Read application specifications. No concerns. Williams – Locus map needs to be pulled farther out.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	60622	
16. Taylor, Levin	25 Hussey Street-HSAB	Hardscaping: shower/paving	42.3.4-54	Tom Hanlon
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	(02:00:05) Staff – Read application specifications. Williams – Suggested a view as the plans aren't highlighted.			
Motion	Motion to View without comment and drawings corrected to indicate areas of new. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		
17. Providence Assoc LLC	7 Village Way	Pool/Hardscape	14-4	Cottage & Castle
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.			
Representing	Jamie Feeley , Cottage and Castle Construction – Presented an updated siting at the table. Explained the fencing.			
Public	None			
Concerns	(02:02:05) Staff – Read application specifications. Discussion about the location of the fencing; no apparent concerns about the pool. Williams – There is no well to tell how much fencing there is. Prefer a 4-foot natural to weather fence kept tight to the pool; do not think a wire fence is appropriate. Coombs – Agrees with Ms Williams. The plans need to be larger. Barham – Would the like location of the fence to allow space for a chair and walking around the pool.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information and revisions. (Barham)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #		

18. Dyer, Paul 20 Tashama Lane Rev. COA 27412: garage 55-450 Link
 Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs, Camp
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.
 Representing **Victory Ewing**, LINK Permitting and Design – Presented project, as-built
 Public None
 Concerns (02:07:52) **Staff** – Read application specifications. The as-built fee needs to be paid.
Williams – “This” is a no go. There is no adequate site plan. “This” can’t be that close to “that.”
Barham – Would like to view with corrected and complete drawings.
 Motion **Motion to View with corrected drawings. (Barham)**
 Vote Carried unanimously **Certificate #**

19. Dyer, Paul 20 Tashama Lane Rev. COA 33491: house 55-450 Link
 Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs, Camp
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation File with associated plans, photos and required documentation.
 Representing **Victory Ewing**, LINK Permitting and Design – Presented project, as-built
 Public None
 Concerns (02:13:34) **Staff** – Read application specifications. The as-built fee needs to be paid.
Barham – Suggested a view.
 Motion **Motion to View with the original approval. (Barham)**
 Vote Carried unanimously **Certificate #**

VI. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes	October 22, 24 & 29 – Motion to Approve. (Camp) Carried 2-0/Barham & Williams abstain.
Review Minutes	November 5
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Executive Session: Status and clarification of 8 Milestone Road – Held • Discussion on agenda/meeting composition: not segregating old/new business meetings – Held • 8 North Water Street hardscaping/ granite curbing in OHD – Wants the commissioners to go look at it. • 82 Main Street discussion of status of structure – Motion to issue a request for legal assistance in regards to a demolition by neglect. (Barham) Carried unanimously • 13 Blackfish Lane electrical panel – Inspection issue, to be on the November 20 agenda.

Motion to Adjourn: 3:18 p.m.

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
 TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board